

**MINUTES
TOWN OF CAMP VERDE
REGULAR SESSION
MAYOR AND COUNCIL
473 S. MAIN STREET, SUITE 106
WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 16, 2023 at 6:30 P.M.**

Note: Council member(s) may attend Council Sessions either in person, by telephone, or internet/video conferencing.

1. **Call to Order** Mayor Dee Jenkins called the meeting to order at 6:30 PM.
2. **Roll Call.** Council Members: Jackie Baker, Wendy Escoffier, Robin Godwin, Cris McPhail, Jessie Murdock, Vice Mayor Marie Moore, and Mayor Dee Jenkins.

Also Present. Town Manager Tedmond Soltis, Town Attorney Trish Stuhan, Deputy Clerk Virginia Jones, Assistant Clerk, Jadie Edwards, Recording Secretary Mary Frewin

3. **Pledge of Allegiance** Councilor Baker led the Pledge of Allegiance.
4. **Consent Agenda** – All those items listed below may be enacted upon by one motion and approved as consent agenda items. Any item may be removed from the Consent Agenda and considered as a separate item if a member of Council requests.

a) Approval of the Minutes:

- 1) Special Executive Session – July 12, 2023
- 2) Special Session – July 12, 2023
- 3) Regular Session – July 19, 2023
- 4) Joint Special Session – July 26, 2023
- 5) Special Session – August 2, 2023
- 6) Regular Session – August 2, 2023

b) Set Next Meeting, Date and Time:

- 1) Special Session – Wednesday August 23, 2023 at 5:30 p.m.
- 2) Regular Session – Wednesday September 6, 2023 at 6:30 p.m. CANCELLED
- 3) Executive Session – Wednesday September 20, 2023 at 5:30 p.m.
- 4) Regular Session – Wednesday September 20, 2023 at 6:30 p.m.

c) Approval of Notice of Intent – Proposed Increase, Water and Wastewater Rates, Fees, or Services Charges. Staff Resource: Mike Showers

Mayor Jenkins pulled all the minutes from 4a, as the Clerk was not in attendance and there were changes to be made.

Vice Mayor Moore asked to pull 4C for a later discussion. She also would like the item to say "if approved by Council, the rates will increase in January 2024 and annually adjust thereafter."

On a motion from Councilor McPhail, seconded by Councilor Escoffier, Council moved to approve consent agenda item 4B.

Roll Call Vote:

Councilor Baker: Aye
Councilor Escoffier: Aye
Councilor McPhail: Aye
Councilor Murdock: Aye
Councilor Godwin: Aye
Vice Mayor Moore: Aye
Mayor Jenkins: Aye

Motion Carried 7-0.

Charlotte Salsman spoke on 4C, proposed Water and Wastewater Fee Increases. She shared concerns that with these proposed increases, both of her rates will be increasing, despite her usage not increasing. She was also concerned about the recent presentation on water and wastewater increases. She said she didn't think it was fair to be paying more for water per gallon than other people. She would like this to be investigated.

Wayne Johnson spoke on 4C, wanting to echo what Ms. Salsman said. He feels water and sewer rates should be set on usage. He, too, would like this to be investigated before rates are set.

Utilities Director Jeff Low stated that the public hearing for these increases will take place on November 1st in the Council Chambers. The public will have plenty of opportunity to speak.

On a motion by Vice Mayor Moore, seconded by Councilor McPhail, Council moved to approve 4C with the corrections previously stated.

Roll Call Vote:

Councilor Baker: Aye
Councilor Escoffier: Aye
Councilor McPhail: Aye
Councilor Murdock: Aye
Councilor Godwin: Aye
Vice Mayor Moore: Aye
Mayor Jenkins: Aye

Motion Carried 7-0.

- 5. Call to the Public or items not on the Agenda. (Please complete Request to Speak Card and turn in to the Clerk.)** Residents are encouraged to comment about any matter NOT included on the agenda. State law prevents the Council from taking any action on items not on the agenda. At the conclusion of an open call to the public, individual members of the public body may respond to criticism made by those who have addressed the public body, may ask staff to review a matter or may ask that a matter be put on a future agenda. However, members of the public body shall not discuss or take legal action on matters raised during an open call to the public unless the matters are properly noticed for discussion and

legal action. (Pursuant to ARS §38-431.01(H))

Library Director Kathy Hellman spoke regarding the Library. Ms. Hellman spoke in support of the Library and the staff. She has been very disappointed to see all the recent attacks on the Library. With many years of experience and involvement in the library, she is committed to the Library and what they stand for.

Diane Hopper spoke regarding the Library. She, too, spoke in support. She feels we should be proud of the Library we have and the resourced it brings to the citizens. She does not feel that books should be banned.

Lynn Sweitzer spoke regarding the Library. She spoke in support of the Library. She has been very involved and thinks the way the library has been run is phenomenal. She feels there should be resources for children to check out to answer some of the questions they may have.

Andrew Barber spoke regarding the Library. He feels that there should not be book censorship. He supports the Camp Verde Library and feels that the town should as well. He doesn't feel that parents should dictate what children other than their own should read. He brought a screen shot of someone making a death threat to someone at the Library and will distribute it out to Council.

Janet Pugh spoke regarding the Library. She spoke against the recent books displayed in the Library. She feels that certain books at the Library expose children to things that they're not ready to see.

Mark Gardner spoke regarding the Library. He spoke in support of the Library. He feels its offensive in the modern era to ban books. He feels this isn't the answer.

Michelle Gore spoke regarding the Library. She spoke in support of the Library, and is disappointed to see the recent events in the Town. She is not in support of banning or restricting books and gave reasons why. She does not want the Town to be remembered as a hateful place by banning books.

6. Special Announcements and Presentations:

- **Information related to existing Economic Development grant revenue (up to \$15,840) to help fund Manzanita Outreach's mission to provide food assistance to the residents and workforce. Staff Resource: Molly Spangler**

Economic Development Director Molly Spangler introduced the Director of Manzanita Outreach, Ben Burke. She shared that they will be using some of their grant revenue to fund Manzanita Outreach's mission to provide food and assistance to the residents and workforce.

Mr. Burke Spoke in support of Nicole Metz-Andrews. He went on to share about Manzanita Outreach and the services that they offer to the Verde Valley. He shared that they are a nonprofit organization that has been serving the Verde Valley for five years

now. They are the largest food assistant provider in Yavapai County as well as one of the largest rural food assistant providers in the country. A new service that they have started offering is snack boxes and school supplies for local schools. This will be a big year of growth for Manzanita Outreach as they take on new projects.

Councilor Baker thanked Mr. Burke and Ms. Spangler for the presentation.

Councilor Escoffier also thanked Mr. Burke and Ms. Spangler for the presentation. Councilor Murdock said she has the pleasure of seeing firsthand the food and supplies that Manzanita Outreach provides to the schools. She thanked Mr. Burke and his organization for what they do for the students in Camp Verde.

- **Appreciation and Acknowledgment of service for Interim Town Manager Barbara Goodrich**

Town Clerk Cindy Pemberton spoke via Zoom on behalf of the Town, she thanked Interim Town Manager Barbara Goodrich for her service. She said Ms. Goodrich has been an invaluable resource to the staff.

Mayor Jenkins also thanked Ms. Goodrich. She feels she has helped move the Town in a good direction.

Councilor Murdock thanked Ms. Goodrich for being a once in a lifetime find in the Town.

Vice Mayor Moore shared that Ms. Goodrich has been such a blessing to the Town.

She feels she was an amazing representative of the Town and has guided the Council in many ways.

Councilor Escoffier thanked Ms. Goodrich for her professionalism and guidance.

Councilor Baker thanked Ms. Goodrich for being so helpful to the community.

Councilor Godwin thanked Ms. Goodrich for her openness and time. She also thanked her for keeping her cool. She feels the Town has benefitted from her demeanor.

Ms. Goodrich thanked Mayor Jenkins, Vice Mayor Moore, and Council for their support during her time working here.

7. Summary of Current Events

Councilor Godwin shared that she is the liaison for the Phillip England Center for Performing Arts. She shared that on September 10th at 3:00 p.m. there will be A Cappella Syndicate. She hopes to fill the Center.

Councilor McPhail said she attended Tribal Council Meetings and teen game night at the Library.

Vice Mayor Moore reminded the Town that this Saturday at the Camp Verde Rodeo Arena, there will be a Redneck Roundup Demolition Derby at 6:00 p.m.

She also shared that on August 22nd APS is hosting a free energy mixer at the BRIC. This is a great event to go to in order to get questions answered about your electric bill.

Councilor Baker attended a MATForce meeting and shared the great job they're doing to educate citizens on drugs.

Councilor Escoffier went to the Arizona County Clerks Summer Conference presenting

with the Maricopa County retired Clerk. She shared that the Copper Canyon Fire and Medical District changed their meeting this month to the 4th Thursday at 9:00 a.m. Additionally, the Library is hosting Tom's Story on August 26th at 9 a.m.

Councilor Murdock had nothing to report.

Mayor Jenkins attended a new series of meetings that the District Supervisor in Yavapai County has put together. She also attended a meeting with Northern Arizona Healthcare, as they have had a change with their C.E.O. Additionally, she attended her normal Mayor meetings.

Town Manager Ted Soltis shared that he's been going to a lot of meetings, and he is very thankful for Ms. Goodrich and her wealth of information as she passes the baton onto him.

Ms. Goodrich shared that the Town of Camp Verde is forming a citizen work group to look at the animal count ordinance. They are accepting applications through e-mail until August 23rd. You can e-mail Mr. Soltis.

She also shared that the Town is planning to have up to 21 electrical vehicle charging stations. There are 3 different locations that have put in applications to the Town.

8. Discussion Consideration and Possible Award of Bid #23-175, Camp Verde Schools Traffic Improvements Project to McDonald Bros. Construction in the amount of \$283,635.13. Staff Resource: Martin Smith

Martin Smith shared that they had the plans drawn up, approved, and the project went out to bid. The lowest bid came from McDonald Brothers Construction in the amount of \$283,635.13 and he would recommend that they consider awarding that bid.

Vice Mayor Moore asked Mr. Martin when the construction would start. She requested that there would be plenty of notification to residents about construction, as it gets chaotic and congested in that area.

Mr. Martin told her that the start date has not yet been determined, but he's working to coordinate it with the contractor. He would look for construction to begin in the middle of September.

Councilor Godwin wondered how this would be coordinated with the school.

Mr. Martin said the Town will be funding the project, and the school district will be refunding the Town with a grant that they've received. Their portion is up to \$150,000.

On a motion by Councilor Baker, seconded by Councilor McPhail, Council moved to award bid #23-175 Camp Verde Schools traffic Improvements Project to McDonald Brothers Construction in the amount of \$283,635.13.

Roll Call Vote:

Councilor Baker: Aye

Councilor Escoffier: Aye

Councilor McPhail: Aye

Councilor Murdock: Aye
Councilor Godwin: Aye
Vice Mayor Moore: Aye
Mayor Jenkins: Aye
Motion Carried 7-0.

9. Discussion, Consideration, and Possible Award of Bid #23-176, Gazebo Demolition Project to Ligon Excavation in the amount of \$31,742.70. Staff Resource: Martin Smith

Mr. Smith shared that after direction from Council to conduct a competitive public bid for the demolition project of the Town Gazebo, Ligon Excavation came in with the lowest bid at \$31,742.70. Ligon Excavation is licensed and completely capable to do this work.

Vice Mayor Moore shared that her concerns are that Ligon Excavation's bid was substantially less than the two other bids. She doesn't want change orders coming back. Ligon's bid is over \$20,000 less than the others, which are within \$2,000 of each other. Mr. Martin said the difference in the bids is not uncommon. What it typically means is that Ligon Excavation wants the work. He stated that in the bid process they do have 10% owner allowance if any extras should pop up. It's his belief that they won't need that.

Councilor Godwin shared some thoughts on the Gazebo. She said she hopes they all look at the packet she provided them to see the original design of the Gazebo and the plans they had for it once it's restored. She's a big proponent of having a replacement for the gazebo that will weather time better, as it's a big focal point for downtown.

Councilor Escoffier clarified that the Gazebo, in the form it's in, cannot be restored. She looks forward to doing a facilities masterplan to look at the area and see what they can have there.

On a motion by Councilor McPhail, seconded by Councilor Baker, Council moved to award bid #23-176, Gazebo Demolition Project to Ligon Excavation in the amount of \$31,742.70.

Roll Call Vote:

Councilor Baker: Aye
Councilor Escoffier: Aye
Councilor McPhail: Aye
Councilor Murdock: Aye
Councilor Godwin: Aye
Vice Mayor Moore: Aye
Mayor Jenkins: Aye

Motion Carried 7-0

10. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Approval designating the Mayor as signatory on the letter of support regarding the Yavapai-Apache Land Exchange. Staff Resource: Barbara Goodrich

Ms. Goodrich shared that this agenda item is specifically looking for possible approval designating the Mayor as signatory on the letter of support regarding the Yavapai Apache land exchange. The Yavapai Apache Nation is proposing to exchange and transfer to the United States approximately 4,780 acres of nation owned inholdings within the national forest land in Arizona for approximately 3,200 acres that are within the Prescott and Coconino National Forest that is mostly contiguous to the Nations reservation.

On a motion by Vice Mayor Moore, seconded by Councilor McPhail, council moved to approve Mayor Dee Jenkins or her designee to sign the letter of support for the Yavapai Apache Nation land exchange.

Roll Call Vote:

Councilor Baker: Aye

Councilor Escoffier: Aye

Councilor McPhail: Aye

Councilor Murdock: Aye

Councilor Godwin: Aye

Vice Mayor Moore: Aye

Mayor Jenkins: Aye

Motion Carried 7-0.

11. **Discussion, Consideration, and Possible Approval of Ordinance 2023-A477, an Ordinance of the Mayor and Common Council of the Town of Camp Verde, Yavapai County, Arizona amending the Town of Camp Verde Planning and Zoning Ordinance, with minor text amendments within Section 203 – Use Districts, regarding residential accessory structure setbacks.** Staff Resource: BJ Ratlief

Town Planner BJ Ratlief shared with Council that staff is trying to clarify an exception that already exists within the ordinance. The ordinance allows for setbacks for dwelling units, homes, and for accessory structures. She stated that the exception for accessory structures just says, "an accessory structure may encroach into the rear setback". The rear setback in most places is 25 feet, but for an accessory structure there's an exception that says you can encroach into it, but it doesn't say how much. For many years, the Building Official has advised at least a 5 foot setback, mainly for building materials. If buildings get too close to one another, you must add additional building material for fire prevention. This recommendation, however, is not solidified somewhere, so they are trying to solidify it and clean it up. In a discussion amongst staff, they recommend 7-foot unless it's on a corner lot, in which the recommend a 10-foot setback.

Mayor Dee Jenkins opened the public hearing at 7:39.

Mayor Dee Jenkins closed the public hearing at 7:39.

Vice Mayor Moore wondered why it's a 10 ft setback for a corner lot, and not just 7 ft. Ms. Ratlief told her that it is primarily for safety. This would provide for better visibility. It would stay consistent with the side setback. Vice Mayor Moore was concerned that this would inhibit residents from being able to build what they want on their property. She feels

that people pay for their entire property and should be able to utilize their entire property.

Ms. Ratlief responded to her that Building Officials recommend no less than 5 ft. If buildings are put too close to one another, a safety hazard is created. A Building Official would say that additional materials would need to be added for fire protection. The 5 ft came from rule of thumb, but staff wanted to recommend 7 ft for consistency. Ms. Ratlief told her that as it stands, people have the ability to go less than 5 ft, however, in the passing of this ordinance, they would be limited to the 7 ft.

Vice Mayor Moore did not agree with this.

Councilor Baker wondered about structures that are already in place. How would they regulate new structures vs old ones?

Ms. Ratlief said that they would trust the citizens. Anything less than what Council approves tonight would become legal nonconforming and would exist that way. However, it would have to be investigated if changes wanted to be made.

Councilor Baker agreed with Vice Mayor Moore.

Councilor Escoffier wondered how much space a fire truck would need to get between two buildings.

Ms. Ratlief told her none. Most properties that are residential and back up to each other often don't allow for space. For a commercial property, there would be requirements.

Councilor McPhail felt there were a couple of options. She said it would be burdensome to have fire retardant materials on a structure less than 5 ft. She feels the 5 ft or 7 ft would be doable.

Community Development Director John Knight spoke to help Council understand why they are recommending the 7 ft. He said there are a lot of rural residential properties in Town with smaller lots. He asked Council that if nothing else, they looked at the rural residential and fix that. He said the 7 ft recommendation would keep it consistent, however, 5 ft would be fine too, as it meets building code. It would, however, be a significant cost to residents to make their structures fireproof if there were no limitations in place. He said the biggest winner in this change would be taking many of the legal non-conforming structures and making them legal.

Mayor Jenkins wondered why this came to Planning and Zoning in December of '22, and it's just now before Council.

Mr. Knight told her there were a handful of challenging cases they were dealing with that took up a lot of their time. They should have brought it sooner, but it wasn't the most important thing on their docket.

Councilor Murdock wondered if they've always just followed the dwelling for accessory uses. She would like to know a comparison from the old and new.

Mr. Knight shared that the code is confusing for accessory structures. In passing this, it would clean that up to be more consistent.

Councilor Murdock said she's in support of the 7 ft.

Vice Mayor Moore shared that she would be okay with the 7 ft, but she doesn't want to take away from citizens the ability to utilize their entirety of their property in the way that they want. She wants citizens to have the ability to go less.

Mr. Knight said he would not recommend going less than 5 ft, as it would create a lot of confusion for people.

Vice Mayor Moore wondered how staff is currently dealing with residences that have placed structures less than 5 ft.

Mr. Knight replied that since he's been here, he hasn't dealt with that because they recommend 5 ft to people.

Councilor Godwin was concerned with the disagreement on just 2 ft. She doesn't feel that there's any problem with 7 ft by 7ft. She's happy with what has been brought forward, and thanked Ms. Ratlief and Mr. Knight for having such a clear presentation and plan to move forward.

Mr. Knight shared that another consideration is the height of the structure. Maximum height for an accessory structure is the same as maximum height for a primary structure, which is 30 feet tall. This is something to keep in mind if they go less than 5 ft, requiring citizens to make their structure fire-proof.

He shared that they still want to do a comprehensive update on the code, so if they don't agree with this today, they can always come back to it later.

Councilor Baker shared that she's okay with the 5 ft and 5 ft.

Councilor Escoffier wondered if a structure is closer to the property line, can there be a lower height requirement.

Mr. Knight said yes, but it's difficult to implement.

Councilor Escoffier said she supports staff's recommendation.

On a motion by Councilor Godwin, seconded by Councilor Escoffier, Council moved to approve ordinance 2023-A477.

Roll Call Vote:

Councilor Baker: Aye

Councilor Escoffier: Aye

Councilor McPhail: Aye

Councilor Murdock: Aye

Councilor Godwin: Aye

Vice Mayor Moore: Nay

Mayor Jenkins: Aye

Motion Carried 6-1.

12. **Discussion, Consideration, and Possible Approval of Ordinance 2023-A478, an Ordinance of the Mayor and Common Council of the Town of Camp Verde, Yavapai County, Arizona amending the Town of Camp Verde Planning and Zoning Ordinance with minor text amendments within Section 502.A – Land**

Division, regarding text edits to clarify language. Staff Resource: BJ Ratlief

This item was pulled by staff.

13. Discussion, Consideration and Possible Appointment of Council members as Town Representatives and alternates for the Verde Front. Staff Resource: Barbara Goodrich

Ms. Goodrich shared that this item came before them because Vice Mayor Moore would like to pass on the opportunity to be the Town Representative for the Verde Front to another Council member. It has become too much of a time constraint for her with her work schedule. Mayor Jenkins would like to continue as the alternate.

Councilor McPhail shared some information on Verde Front.

Councilor Murdock requested a progress report update on Verde Front.

After Council discussion, Councilor Escoffier volunteered to become the Town representative for the Verde Front.

On a motion by Councilor Godwin, seconded by Councilor McPhail, Council moved to appoint Councilor Escoffier to the town representative for Verde Front with Mayor Dee Jenkins as the alternate.

Roll Call Vote:

Councilor Baker: Aye
Councilor Escoffier: Aye
Councilor McPhail: Aye
Councilor Murdock: Aye
Councilor Godwin: Aye
Vice Mayor Moore: Aye
Mayor Jenkins: Aye

Motion Carried 7-0

14. Adjournment Mayor Dee Jenkins adjourned the meeting at 8:19 PM.



Mayor Dee Jenkins



Attest: Town Clerk Cindy Pemberton

CERTIFICATION

I hereby certify that the foregoing Minutes are a true and accurate accounting of the actions of the Mayor and Common Council of the Town of Camp Verde during the Regular Session of the Town Council of Camp Verde, Arizona, held on August 16th, 2023. I further certify that the meeting was duly called and held, and that a quorum was present.

Dated this 26th day of Sept, 2023.


Cindy Pemberton, Town Clerk