

**MINUTES  
SPECIALSESSION  
THE PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION  
TOWN OF CAMP VERDE 473 S. MAIN STREET  
CAMP VERDE, AZ. 86322  
COUNCIL CHAMBERS STE. 106  
THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 22, 2022  
6:30 PM**

*All Commission meetings will end at 9 PM, any remaining agenda items will be heard at the next Commission meeting.*

**1. Call to Order**

Chairman Faiella called the meeting to order at 6:40 p.m.

**2. Roll Call**

Chairman Andrew Faiella, Vice Chairman Todd Scantlebury, Commissioners Greg Blue, William Tippett, Michael Hough, Ingrid Osses were present. Robert Foreman is absent.

**Also Present**

Community Development Director John Knight, Administrative Assistant/Assistant Planner BJ Ratlief, Town Clerk Cindy Pemberton, Heather Vinson and Recording Secretary Jennifer Reed.

**3. Pledge of Allegiance**

Commissioner Scantlebury led the Pledge.

- 4. Consent Agenda -** All those items listed below may be enacted upon by one motion and approved as Consent Agenda Items. Any item may be removed from the Consent Agenda and considered as a separate item if a member of Commission so requests.  
No Items.

**5. Call to the Public for Items Not on the Agenda**

*Residents are encouraged to comment about any matter not included on the agenda. State law prevents the Commission from taking any action on items not on the agenda, except to set them for consideration at a future date.*

No public comments.

- 6. Continued Public Hearing from September 8, 2022 -Discussion, Consideration, and Possible Recommendation to the Mayor and Common Council to approve a request by Tanner Bryson (agent for owner Donald Bryson) for a Zoning Map Change from R1-70 (Residential: Single Family, 70,000 square foot minimum lot size) to R1-70/PAD (Residential: Single Family, 70,000 square foot minimum lot size/Planned Area Development) for approximately 4.4 acres located at 1738 Arena del Loma (APN 404-18-1780Q). The purpose of the request is to permit a commercial equestrian arena and recreational vehicle lodging. The request includes the following specified activities and events: equestrian training, roping events, barrel racing, team roping, fundraisers, equestrian show events, potlucks, parties, car shows, and festivals. Staff Resource: John Knight**

## • Staff Comments

Community Development Director John Knight said this meeting is a continuation of Public Hearing from last week. He wanted to review what had been accomplished since we last met. The both attorneys and the applicant met and made significant progress on the agreement. It comes down to three conditions where there are still differences. Mr. Knight said there were three letters that came to his department today in which he provided copies to Commissioners. The letters were from Yavapai Apache Nation, the Neighborhood Coalition and Carol Ferguson. He went through the conditions and pointed out the conditions that are in disagreement. Background and summary of the request includes:

- Placement and use of 20 RVs – some permanent and some shorter term
- Equestrian related events and activities of varying sizes and frequency up to 300 participants,
- Hours of operation in winter from 8 am to 6 pm and in summer from 5 am to 12 midnight,
- Up to 350 combined horses and cattle during special events,
- Use of amplified sound for events and activities.

The approval tonight would include all the applicants requested letter of intent, Exhibits A, B, C, D, & E. The three conditions are included in staff report, he would like to read them into the record:

1. The applicant shall comply with the requirements contained in the submitted project narrative and application materials (Exhibits A – E)
2. The applicant shall submit for Final Development Plan/Site Plan for approval for review by the Planning and Zoning Commission and Town Council according to Section 201.L.2. of the Zoning Ordinance. This request shall also include a proposed Development Schedule. The applicant shall also submit for Development Standards review per Section 400 of the Zoning Ordinance.
3. This approval ~~rescinds~~ **supplements** the 2016 Notice of Decision to expand and better define the authorized uses of the subject property.
4. Prior to any construction or improvements, the applicant shall obtain building permits for all new structures, as required by the Chief Building Official and Building Code.
5. Town shall be allowed to enter the property for inspections in accordance with condition 13 to ensure compliance with this condition. In addition, the applicant shall submit a quarterly report to the Community Development Director certifying that the number of RVs is in compliance with Exhibit B – RV Plan. This includes a maximum of 20 RVs as follows: a. Two (2) permanent RVs for full time onsite caretakers, b. Six (6) RV sites for instructors up to 6 months at a time, and c. Twelve (12) short term stay sites; less than 31 days.
6. RV use and occupancy can only be in conjunction with arena events and activities identified in Exhibit C – Events and Operations Plan.
7. The Final Development Plan shall demonstrate that a minimum of 1,500 sf is provided for each RV site in accordance with Section 306.C.2. of the Zoning Ordinance.
8. The Event Mitigation Plan shall be submitted to the Community Development Department for review and approval, which shall not be unreasonably withheld, at least two (2) weeks prior to any Large Events in accordance with Exhibits C and E.

9. Throughout the year, arena events as described in Exhibit C will conclude by 10 pm each night, though activities incidental to the authorized uses on the property may extend past 10 pm. Those present on the property shall abide by the Town's Noise Ordinance. The sound from amplified music must be minimized utilizing all the following methods: a) decibel monitoring, b) deflection of sound through barriers, and c) aligning speakers in a location that would direct sound away from the closest neighbors.
10. The applicant shall comply with Section 10-2-1 of the Town Code (Declaration of Nuisance).
11. All proposed lighting shall be made Dark Sky Compliant within twelve (12) months of beginning operation and meet the requirements of Section 405 – Outdoor Lighting, of the Zoning Ordinance.
12. During the first twelve (12) months of operation, the maximum number of large animals housed on the property shall not exceed 445~~175~~. After these twelve (12) months, the applicant may ask for administrative approval to increase the animal counts to the number proposed in Exhibit D – Animal Management Plan which allows for a maximum of 350 large animals for special events. The applicant's request shall be granted, provided all the following criteria are met during the twelve (12) month period:
  - a. There are no more than four (4) citations related to violations of the Town Code, Zoning Ordinance, or PAD requirements, related to animal boarding on the property,
  - b. The applicant has complied with the approved Development Schedule, and
  - c. ~~The applicant has successfully demonstrated the ability to manage manure so that it does not create a nuisance violation related to odor. This shall be documented by Town staff through monthly inspections during the first (12) months as required by condition 13 below.~~
13. For the first twelve (12) months after approval, Town staff shall be allowed to enter the property ~~monthly~~ **quarterly** to monitor and document number of RVs, noise, odor, and other potential nuisances. Town inspections will also be performed as needed to investigate potential violations of the PAD, the Zoning Ordinance, or other Town ordinances. Town staff shall provide advance notice to and coordinate with the property owner or applicant to schedule inspections. ~~After the first twelve (12) months of operation, Town staff shall be allowed to enter the property quarterly solely for the purpose of monitoring. If, after two (2) years, the applicant has demonstrated the ability to comply with all the requirements of the approved PAD, Town inspections will only be performed to investigate potential violations of the PAD, the Zoning Ordinance, or other Town ordinances. **\*\*\*New condition\*\*\* it is in the best interest in the town to do quarterly inspections.**~~
14. Manure piles shall be contained within a block structure, covered by a tarp, and in a location designed to minimize impact to the neighbors.
15. The proposed uses shall be limited to those identified in the application material and exhibits. All other uses are disallowed.
16. A request for an amendment to the PAD will be deemed major if it involves any of the following and must be approved by the Town Council upon recommendation by the Planning and Zoning Commission:
  - a. An increase in the number of seasonal or permanent RVs housed on the property as provided in the site plan,
  - b. A change in the approved Development Schedule, or
  - c. Any change which could have significant impact on areas adjoining the PAD as determined by the Community Development Director.

17. A request for a Minor Amendment, may be filed with the Community Development Department if the Community Development Director determines the request is not a Major Amendment, as defined above.
18. The number of event attendees shall be limited by the available onsite parking. The applicant shall provide parking at a ratio of one (1) space for every three (3) attendees.
19. As part of the Final Development Plan/Site Plan review by the Planning Commission and Town Council, the applicant shall provide a schedule for development of the specific use or uses (the Development Schedule) for which the zoning is requested, in accordance with Section 9-462.01. e of the Arizona State Statutes. If, at the expiration of this period, the property has not been improved for the use for which it was conditionally approved, the Town Council and approval, after notification by certified mail to the owner and applicant who requested the rezoning, **shall schedule a public hearing to take administrative action to extend, remove or determine compliance with the schedule for development or take legislative action to cause the property to revert to its former zoning classification.**

Chairman Faiella wanted to clarify that if the development is not completed within the allotted time, it goes back to R170 & the Grandfather Rights but not the NOD? Mr. Knight said as we proposed the conditions in the NOD will be rescinded upon approval of the PAD.

Mr. Knight stated that Attorney Bill Simms is attending via Zoom, if Commission has any questions.

#### **Applicant Comment-**

Applicant's Attorney Rose Winkeler, with the Flagstaff Law Group, explained the applicant's position as to the conditions that are still in disagreement. The application before the Commission is for clarifying and setting expectations for both the property owner and the neighbors & Town. Explain what the uses are for this property and address the 2016 NOD. The hope of the application was to put parameters in place, correct the exclusion of RVs, for the uses to align the zoning with the uses of the property, provide expectations and be consistent with the characteristics of the town. She went over the three conditions that are still outstanding:

Condition #3- not trying to maintain the vagueness of the Notice of Decision. The concern is with the recension is the reversion. If there is a reversion, the historical use would be wiped away, then the property could only be developed residential. She believes there should be some flexibility, to preserve the historical use that was established on the property.

Condition #12- points of disagreements are with the number of animals for the first 12-month period. Going through this application he's already reduced the number of animals the NOD provides. The NOD does not provide a limit. In the original application Mr. Bryson limited himself to 350 in this new condition he is voluntarily reducing that number to 175. We are also only talking about animals being present for events and not living on property. Section C they propose striking is already applicable.

Condition #13- They disagree with monthly inspections but are agreeable for quarterly inspections for the first year. Monthly inspections are intrusive and are not an obligation under the ordinances.

Chairman Faiella asked the NOD as he understands it, addresses RVs and rest of the nonconforming uses are not effective by this. If it reverts back to an R1, he doesn't lose the non-conforming rights to do what the arena was originally intended for. How is this an objection. Ms. Winkeler said the objection is outright including it as a condition that this rescinds that decision. Those decisions are ultimately necessary in order to show that the property owner has grandfather rights. Their concern is that if we were to rescind it and make no statement about those grandfather rights continuing on, the applicant "agreed" to eliminating those grandfathered rights by proceeding through the PAD process. Chairman Faiella doesn't see the grandfather rights being eliminated. Ms. Winkeler said the decision, has three separate decisions as part of it. It defines the equine events, livestock numbers and structures. It confirms these uses are grandfathered. The concern is if you rescind it, and if in 10 years there is a new commission & staff look at this report and see this decision was rescinded, it will be ineffective. If you want to continue the uses, you would have to go prove your case again that this is authorized non-conforming use. We would ask that a condition be added or we revise the third condition further to make it explicit that those grandfather uses are not rescinded along with the NOD.

Attorney Bill Simms said that was good dialogue. Our point is the notice of decision is completely inconsistent with a PAD and we would prefer to have it rescinded. We could add a clause, (not tonight) that if the zoning reverts pursuant to Section 19, the town acknowledges the applicant may at that time assert whatever legal nonconforming use right the applicant may or may not have. We need to make sure they are not waiving their rights.

Chairman Faiella added on the point of monthly inspections, he said monthly inspections are not intrusive they are just guidance. He doesn't have issues with monthly inspections.

Commissioners discussed and clarified RV's being on the property. Participant RV's verses caretaker residences. There were several misconceptions with RVs on the property and it being turned into an RV Park. Mr. Bryson said it is not going to be an RV Park. Mr. Knight stated under the current zoning, you are allowed to have as many RV' as you want, they just cannot stay more than 10 days per visit.

#### • **Public Hearing Open 7:08pm**

*Chairman Faiella asked the public to fill out a comment card if they would like to speak. They will be allowed 3 minutes to speak. A member of the Public can designate one person to be a spokesperson and designate that person their three minutes. Commission cannot comment during this time.*

#### **Public Comments:**

**Pete Roulette-** a local realtor and owns property near the arena. He is against spot zoning. He said no one is against the arena, it is a local arena, commercial venue will affect property values. He doesn't like that the town could change the zoning to a PAD to accommodate a property owners wish to do whatever they'd like to do on their property. He agrees with current use, then if there are no violations under current use for 2-3 years, then let's talk about doing something different. Spot zoning is not what Camp Verde has ever done.

**Cheryl Wischmeyer-** is here to speak against this proposal. In the past the arena never had: events until midnight, large event sizes as proposed, and no people spending the night there; that is a problem. She read through the past offenses and said it took forever for the offenses to be resolved.

**Tanya Lewis (9mins) speaking on behalf of Eileen Martin & Jerry Geronimo Martin** – She is the Vice Chair of Yavapai Apache Nation. She read the letter she submitted and would like it to be in the record. (See attached)

**Dr. Gail Pete (12mins)- Speaking on behalf of Joanne & Matt Jahnke & Janice Hawk-** she is a resident of Camp Verde and a veterinarian. She does not want the arena eliminated but the issue is with the number of animals per acres. She reviewed the point assignments for each animal; assigned by size and density. She stated that there are provisions in the ordinances for trash and garbage; must be kept contained so as not to be a nuisance. She said the applicant should be restricted to town ordinances, immediately.

**John Bassous (39 minutes)- Speaking on behalf of Paul Hawk, John Bassous, Cathy Morgan, Glen Allen, Janet Walther, David Hallum, Jan Allen, Steven Hughes, Keith Christofferson, Ann Everett, Charlotte Salsman, & Debbie Roulette.** Mr. Bassous is speaking on behalf of the Neighborhood Coalition. His issue is not the applicant it's the application. The NOD should be used as a guide. He is disappointed the applicant decided not to have public participate in the discussion. This is a public/neighborhood outreach. The Neighborhood Coalition is made up of 30 neighbors who came up with 17 items. He read through each item (see attached). They are opposed to the commercial aspect of the application and how it affects the neighborhood. They are concerned about the number of animals, sometimes will exceed feed lot standards. It is not a good fit for the size or location of the property. The applicant can continue without a zoning change, the benefits will not change if the zoning change is not granted. The commercial additions do not benefit the neighborhood. He read through some of the other surrounding municipality codes and minimum site requirements. The problem is the property is small. The neighbors say no to commercialization but yes to keeping the historical venue. There are other means and methods to maintain the arena.

**Christa Brunori (via zoom)-** she is confused as to how property values will go down if the PAD is approved, when there are 20 acres in the YAN down the road that is existing. The manure piles have been verified with the Town as true mulch piles. She said there is no long-term permanent odor, and no code violations. The commercial trucks are ag related to the property but no one has problems with delivery service vehicles, trash trucks, welding trucks, or horse transportation for private owners on the road. She said a PAD will bring solutions.

**Applicant Comment/Rebuttal:**

Mr. Bryson said there are misconceptions with the PAD process. He is not attempting to expand to make it more commercial. He is working with the Town voluntarily. He is trying to address complaints from neighbors. He has never had a violation in 10yrs that wasn't remedied. He is operating as he always has, a private for-profit business. The Town has inspected numerous times this year. The PAD is not to expand, but to make accommodations that weren't mentioned in original agreement. He also wanted to note that he thought the public comments were closed so he told the neighbors "for" the project not to come.

Chairman Faiella asked if it is Mr. Bryson's intention to use the arena as a boarding facility. Mr. Bryson said it has always been a year-round boarding facility. It could potentially have 150 animals year-round. For example, when you have a roping club you might have a number of steers to accommodate the roping club.

Chairman Faiella asked if it is his intention to have year-round RVs on site. Mr. Bryson said it is his intention to accommodate guests who come to have a place to stay while they are working with their horses.

Chairman Faiella asked about what is his intention for manure litigation. Mr. Bryson stated he has a dump trailer and takes the manure to wineries and as well as to neighbors upon request for their gardens. He has already removed 17 loads off the property. The town has been out and inspected the mulch pile and it has no odor.

Commissioner Osses doesn't understand why he doesn't want the Town to come out to inspect. The neighbors have complained in the past; this is ligament. The Key is to be a good neighbor. Mr. Bryson said he has complied with the complaints, he even built a wall, and spent a lot of money to clean up the property. The Town is complaint driven and some complaints are out of his control. He would like to look at the complaints that are valid. If there is a valid complaint then the Town can come and inspect. Other than that, it is too much intrusion from government. He went on to say that not one neighbor has come to him on his property. Commissioner Osses said it would show good faith to accept the accommodations; accept the rules and accommodate. She thinks it is important to prove he can follow these rules. Mr. Bryson said he has made a lot of concessions. It is not appropriate to have town come out every month. He has been very open and is going above what the code requires.

Commissioner Hough asked what prompted Mr. Bryson to come and ask for this change. Mr. Bryson said there was an issue with caretakers and RV's being on the property. He is trying to figure out the best way to have caretakers on the property. The NOD was a little vast. He is trying to propose some new parameters, then concentrate money to fix the place up.

Commissioner Hough ask Attorney Sims if the NOD can be amended. Mr. Sims said that is what you are doing with the PAD, the NOD is an instrument, the PAD is a way to correct mistakes. A PAD addresses a number of issues and things that are not under the NOD. He is impressed they were able to narrow the differences down to 2 or 3.

Vice Chair Scantlebury thanked everyone involved, he understands both sides. The town and lawyer are close. The neighborhood is not close. He would like the applicant to come closer to neighbors' requests. He asked Mr. Bryson if he is willing to consider the 17 points the neighbors put together. He suggests tabling this item for another two weeks to get closer to what the neighbors want. Mr. Bryson said we are close; the neighbors just sprang the 17 conditions on him this afternoon. He has already made a number of concessions, and spent lots of money on the attorney. He would like a vote on this tonight.

Commissioner Tippet is confused because this was presented to Commission as a way to preserve historical use as a community event space but Mr. Bryson just said this is a business? Mr. Bryson said yes this is business, he never alluded to it being anything other than a business. The arena is very near and dear to his heart. He doesn't think we need to build houses on it. When it was a non-profit it went into disrepair. This PAD was his attempt in good faith to put parameters for the neighbors. It has been mischaracterized to turn it into a big commercialization project.

Commissioner Hough agrees with what he is requesting. If the PAD has some control the neighbors should appreciate there is some control. Mr. Hough would like to vote on this tonight.



• **Public Hearing Closed: 8:25pm**

*Meeting Break: 8:25pm*

*Meeting Resume: 8:35pm*

• **Commission Discussion- None**

**Motion** was made by Commissioner Osses to recommend to the Mayor and Common Council to approve a request by Tanner Bryson (agent for owner Donald Bryson) for a Zoning Map Change from R1-70 (Residential: Single Family, 70,000 square foot minimum lot size) to R1-70/PAD (Residential: Single Family, 70,000 square foot minimum lot size/Planned Area Development) for approximately 4.4 acres located at 1738 Arena del Loma (APN 404-18-1780Q). The purpose of the request is to permit a commercial equestrian arena and recreational vehicle lodging. The request includes the following specified activities and events: equestrian training, roping events, barrel racing, team roping, fundraisers, equestrian show events, potlucks, parties, car shows, and festivals. The motion includes approval of the following exhibits which are incorporate by reference.

- Letter of Intent (also known as the Application Narrative),
- Exhibit A – Site Plan,
- Exhibit B – RV Plan,
- Exhibit C – Event and Operations Plan,
- Exhibit D – Animal Management Plan
- Exhibit E – Event Mitigation Plan

She makes this recommendation to accept this as staff recommend without the drawing on page 79. Second was made by Commissioner Blue.

Commissioner Scantlebury doesn't expect this to make everyone happy. He doesn't think the numbers are where they ought to be. He thinks we could get closer to an agreement. He also thinks the 2016 should be rescinded.

Commissioner Osses feels like we are already here, we have heard what they want to say. We have no control as it is now, we would have more control with a PAD.

Commissioner Hough stated we are an appointed board. Council is an elected board. He thinks we should send it on to Council. Council will make the final decision.

Chairman Faiella read a prepared statement on his position and added some exceptions he would like added to current motion. Town Clerk Pemberton said nothing can be added to the stated motion that is on the floor. Commissioners would need to vote and if it failed Chairman could then make his motion with his added stipulations.

**Roll Call:**

Chairman Andrew Faiella: nay

Vice Chairman Todd Scantlebury: nay

Commissioner Greg Blue: aye

Commissioner Bill Tippet: nay

Commissioner Michael Hough: aye

Commissioner Ingrid Osses: aye

Commissioner Robert Foreman: absent



**Motion** failed 3-3.

**Motion** was made by Chairman Faiella to recommend to the Mayor and Common Council to approve a request by Tanner Bryson (agent for owner Donald Bryson) for a Zoning Map Change from R1-70 (Residential: Single Family, 70,000 square foot minimum lot size) to R1-70/PAD (Residential: Single Family, 70,000 square foot minimum lot size/Planned Area Development) for approximately 4.4 acres located at 1738 Arena del Loma (APN 404-18-1780Q). The purpose of the request is to permit a commercial equestrian arena and recreational vehicle lodging. The request includes the following specified activities and events: equestrian training, roping events, barrel racing, team roping, fundraisers, equestrian show events, potlucks, parties, car shows, and festivals. The motion includes approval of the following exhibits which are incorporate by reference.

- Letter of Intent (also known as the Application Narrative),
- Exhibit A – Site Plan,
- Exhibit B – RV Plan,
- Exhibit C – Event and Operations Plan,
- Exhibit D – Animal Management Plan
- Exhibit E – Event Mitigation Plan

The motion also includes the following conditions:

1. Accept this as staff recommended without the drawing on page 79,
2. Rescind the 2016 NOD
3. RVs will be permitted during events only, occupied by event participants only, with the exception of up to 2 permanent RVs for caretaker use, 6 RV sites for instructors up to 6 months, 12 short term stay sites for less than 31 days,
4. Hours of operation shall be between 7am and 10pm year-round.
5. Except during events the animal count shall comply with zoning requirements of R1 Zoning,
6. The proposed event size and frequency is presented in Exhibit C and shall be limited to size (1) small 1 to 75 visitors and unlimited frequency, or size medium visitors 76 to 150 and up to 6 per year, no large events of more than 151 visitors is permitted,
7. Until a Final Development Plan is reviewed and approved by the Town of Camp Verde no expansion of commercial operation or events for parking of RVs beyond that which is currently approved in the Town Code R170 is permitted except as may be permitted by a Temporary Use Permit. Second was made by Commissioner Osses.

**Roll Call:**

Chairman Andrew Faiella: aye  
Vice Chairman Todd Scantlebury: aye  
Commissioner Greg Blue: nay  
Commissioner Bill Tippett: nay  
Commissioner Michael Hough: nay  
Commissioner Ingrid Osses: aye  
Commissioner Robert Foreman: absent

**Motion** failed 3-3.

No other motion is made at this time. Mr. Knight explained a failed motion goes to Council as a Defective Denial.

**7. Current Events**

*Individual members of the Commission may provide brief summaries of current events and activities. These summaries are strictly for the purpose of informing the public of such events and activities. The Commission will take no discussion, consideration, or action on any such item, except that an individual Commission member may request an item be placed on a future agenda.*

*No current events.*

**8. Staff Comments**

- The next meeting is scheduled for October 6<sup>th</sup>.

**9. Adjournment**

**Motion** made by Chairman Faiella to adjourn the meeting. Second was made by Commissioner Osses.

**Roll Call:**

Chairman Andrew Faiella: aye  
Vice Chairman Todd Scantlebury: aye  
Commissioner Greg Blue: aye  
Commissioner Bill Tippet: aye  
Commissioner Michael Hough: aye  
Commissioner Ingrid Osses: aye  
Commissioner Robert Foreman: absent

**Motion** passed 6-0.

Meeting was adjourned at 8:54 p.m.



Chairman Drew Faiella



Community Development Director John Knight

**CERTIFICATION**

I hereby certify that the foregoing minutes are a true and accurate accounting of the actions of the Planning & Zoning Commission of the Town of Camp Verde, Arizona during the Special Session held on the 22<sup>nd</sup> day of September 2022. I further certify that the meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

Dated this 22<sup>nd</sup> day of September 2022.



Jennifer Reed, Recording Secretary



# YAVAPAI-APACHE NATION

Executive Office

Chairman Jon Huey

Vice Chairwoman Tanya Lewis

2400 West Datsi Street, Camp Verde, AZ 86322

---

Phone (928)567-1021

Fax (928)567-3994

September 22, 2022

Town of Camp Verde – Planning & Zoning Commission  
437 S. Main Street, Suite 106  
Camp Verde Arizona, 86322

**Subject: Arena Del Loma Community – Proposed Zoning Map Change – 1738 Arena Del Loma, Parcel No. 404-18-178Q**

Zoning Commission:

The above-referenced proposed zoning change has become a community dispute. This dispute is about the future character of the Arena Del Loma residential community. This dispute is about the needs and expectations of community members regarding the character of their community. Community members are entitled to look to the Zoning Commission and the Town Council to protect the predominant community interest in preserving the residential character of Arena Del Loma.

Based on their publicly expressed views, the majority of Arena Del Loma community members need and expect their community to be predominantly residential in its character. Like all homeowners, the people of Arena Del Loma expect their community to be a place where they can enjoy their homes largely free of the sounds, the lights, smells, and traffic that marks the character of a commercial zone. Understandably, people need and expect their homes to be places of refuge where they can retreat at the end of the day to the peace and quiet that allows them to rest and recharge for the challenges of the next day.

On the other hand, the proponent of the zoning change apparently needs and expects the community members to simply accommodate a greatly expanded money-making equestrian facility housing as many as 150 large animals, together with the sights, lights, waste, smells, traffic, and sounds of large-scale arena events. 150 large animals will require a constant stream of animal feed trucked in at all hours – the constant coming and going of commerce in the middle of a residential neighborhood. 150 resident animals will also produce a mountain of

manure, the smell of which will be a constant nuisance to community members. Noise and light pollution will add to the nuisance. The proponent apparently believes that the residential members of the community should simply tolerate what will essentially become the equivalent of a small feed-lot squeezed onto little more than a 4-acre lot.

An objective analysis of the proposed change shows that such an operation does not belong in a residential neighborhood. What is being proposed goes far beyond the small equestrian facility that defined the historical nature of the Arena. What is being proposed is a commercial operation that will fundamentally change the predominant nature of Arena Del Loma as a residential community.

This is the choice facing the planning and zoning commission. Protect the residential character of the community and the needs and expectations of the residential community members, or ignore those needs and expectations in favor of the proposed commercial expansion.

As previously stated in the Nation's letter to the Commission of September 8, 2022, the Nation opposes the commercialization of the Arena through the greatly expanded operations being proposed. The Nation opposes the zoning change because the expanded commercial nature of the proposed uses under the PAD designation are incompatible with the predominant residential nature of the surrounding area. The result will be detrimental to all property owners in the area, including the Nation.

The Nation therefore urges the Commission to reject the proposed zoning change and to recommend to the Town Council its disapproval of the proposed change. To the extent that the Commission forwards a recommendation to the Town Council for approval of the proposed change, the Nation strongly urges the Commission to include strict limitations on the property owner as conditions to the change. In this respect, the Nation joins in the "Neighborhood Coalition Recommended Conditions to Proposed Change" submitted to the Commission by the Coalition on September 22, 2022, copy attached.

Best Regards,



Tanya Lewis  
Vice Chairwoman

CC:  
Camp Verde Town Council  
Yavapai-Apache Nation Tribal Council

## 9-22-22 P & Z Meeting

### Neighborhood Coalition Recommended Conditions to Proposed Change

1. Arena hours of operation for publicly advertised events as well as other private events to be limited to 8:00 A.M. to 10:00 P.M.
2. Number of Full time on-site animals (livestock) shall be limited to eight (8) as prescribed by Camp Verde Town Code (Section 305, P 86-89).
3. The number of additional animals temporarily brought to the Arena for publicly advertised and private events shall not to exceed 150 for any event.
4. Animal boarding, including boarding for training purposes, shall be strictly prohibited.
5. Caretaker quarters shall be limited to one (1) permanent structure, such as a modular/mobile home unit or site built unit. **NO PERMANENT OR SEASONAL RV SITES WILL BE PERMITTED**
6. Provision be made to have up to twenty (20) RV/Living Quarters plug in's (receptacles) for use only by participants of publicly advertised and private equine events. Maximum stay is limited to three (3) nights.  
Participants arriving early for events may arrive as early as 6:00 A.M. Those choosing to utilize generators cannot use them past 10:00 P.M.
7. All publicly advertised events must be completed by 10:00 P.M. This includes all vehicles exiting the Arena by 10:00 P.M.
8. All twenty (20) RV/Living Quarter spaces along with the single permanent Caretakers quarters must be hooked up to an approved and permitted septic system
9. Traffic is to be restricted to those attending the publicly advertised and private events, during the hours of 6:00 A.M. -10:00 P.M.
10. Event parking shall not expand beyond property boundaries or impact neighboring properties.
11. The Arena may not to be used as distribution center for large trucks bringing in other materials not associated with the Arena and it's permitted uses.
12. The Arena may not to be used as a "mulching" operation or for sales of such by products. All manure produced by on-site and temporary event animals must be completely removed from the property weekly.
13. The Arena shall not engage in any commercial operations, such as hay sales, or the boarding and breeding of horses, storage of trailers or other equipment, or any other commercial uses.
14. Exterior lights must come into compliance with Town code (Town Code Section 405 Pgs. 123 ff) Directional lights will prevent light emission impacting neighbors.
15. Arena must comply with the Town's noise ordinance. Sound from amplified arena announcing and music must be minimized by decibel monitoring and reporting, use of sound-deflecting barriers, and placing speakers at angles that avoid directing sound at nearby homes.
16. Property Owner must construct 24' wide hard packed road, able to sustain Emergency Vehicles in the event of medical or fire emergencies, with two (2) legal points of Ingress & Egress.
17. All animals, whether on-site or temporary, must be contained within industry-standard fencing, corrals, and stalls.